A. INTRODUCTION

This chapter considers the potential for the Phased Redevelopment of Governors Island (the Proposed Project) to affect historic and cultural resources. The Proposed Project would involve changes to a number of sites within the 70-acre portion of the Governors Island Historic District (a National Historic Landmark District that is also a New York City Historic District [NYCHD] and listed on the State and National Registers of Historic Places [S/NR]) and in the 80 acres of the South Island administered by The Trust.

Historic and archaeological resources were considered in the *Governors Island Disposition Final Environmental Impact Statement* (FEIS) published in 1998. The 1998 FEIS identified potential archaeologically sensitive sites and historic resources and led to the development of the *Governors Island Preservation and Design Manual* (Design Manual). Prepared by the General Services Administration (GSA) and published in 2003, the Design Manual was developed to help guide the reuse of the Historic District portion of the Island, while ensuring preservation of the historic and architectural resources that contribute to the Island's importance. The Design Manual's "Preservation and Design Standards" were developed by the GSA in consultation with the New York City Department of City Planning (DCP), New York City Landmarks Preservation Commission (LPC), the New York State Office of Parks, Recreation, and Historic Preservation (OPRHP), the Advisory Council on Historic Preservation, and the National Trust for Historic Preservation. The Design Manual's "Preservation and Design Standards" and "Design and Development Guidelines" were intended to be the basis for project review by OPRHP and LPC.

Given the Island's physical isolation, the areas to be considered for the architectural resources analysis are defined as the Island itself, off-Island sites where work for the Proposed Project would be required, and a study area around these off-Island sites. The areas to be considered for archaeological resources for the Proposed Project are any on-Island and off-Island sites where ground-disturbing activities may be required.

Architectural resources to be analyzed include: New York City Landmarks (NYCLs), Interior Landmarks, Scenic Landmarks, and New York City Historic Districts (NYCHDs); resources calendared for consideration as one of the above by LPC; resources listed on or formally determined eligible for inclusion on the State and/or National Registers of Historic Places, or contained within a district listed on or formally determined eligible for listing on the Registers; resources recommended by the New York State Board for listing on the Registers; National Historic Landmarks; and any potential architectural resources identified through a survey of off-Island project sites and study areas.

B. PRINCIPAL CONCLUSIONS

PHASE 1

Phase 1 of the Proposed Project would not be expected to have significant adverse impacts on historic and cultural resources. The design for the Phase 1 park and public space improvements within the Historic District would be reviewed and approved by LPC under the New York City Landmarks Law and/or OPRHP (as appropriate). The proposed landscaping work within the Historic District would be consistent with the guidelines for new landscaping in the Design Manual, and changes to Colonels Row Green, Nolan Park, and the Parade Ground would not adversely affect the character-defining elements of those features. In particular, the improvements to the Parade Ground for active recreation would not significantly affect the overall appearance of this character-defining element of the Historic District or its visual appearance as an open lawn.

Since Phase 1 of the project would occur on or within in close proximity to contributing elements of the Governors Island Historic District and the Governors Island National Monument, a construction protection plan (CPP) would be developed—based on the requirements stipulated in the New York City Department of Buildings (DOB) *Technical Policy and Procedure Notice* (TPPN) *#10/88*—to ensure that historic structures and landscape elements within 90 feet of construction activities would not be inadvertently affected during construction. The CPP would need to be reviewed and approved by LPC and/or OPRHP (as appropriate). Furthermore, construction of the Proposed Project would be conducted in accordance with the guidelines of the Design Manual and with the New York City Landmarks Law.

Since Phase 1 of the Proposed Project would not alter any buildings in the Historic District, it would not be expected to have an adverse contextual effect on historic resources in the surrounding area, including adjacent portions of the Governors Island Historic District and the Governors Island National Monument.

LATER PHASES

The parks and open space improvements to be developed on the Island during the Later Phases of the Proposed Project are not anticipated to have significant adverse visual or contextual effects on architectural resources. The design for the park and public space improvements that are located within the Historic District, including plans for the new open canopy ferry shelter at Yankee Landing, would be reviewed and approved by LPC under the New York City Landmarks Law and/or OPRHP (as appropriate), pursuant to the Design Manual.

As in Phase 1 of the Proposed Project, a CPP would be developed for the Later Phases of the Proposed Project to ensure that historic structures and landscape elements within 90 feet of construction activities would not be inadvertently affected during construction.

At this time, the uses associated with the Later Phases of the Island's redevelopment, including for the North Island historic buildings and the two South Island development zones, are not specifically proposed, defined, or designed and their operations have not yet been planned. Details are not available regarding the renovations of any buildings within the Historic District; nor are they available regarding the siting, height, massing, design, or materials of the buildings to be developed on the South Island in the Later Phases-Island Redevelopment of the Proposed Project. Given the lack of plans to review, it is not possible at this time to determine whether the full development of the Proposed Project would or would not be inconsistent with the character

of the Governors Island Historic District or the Governors Island National Monument. The Trust intends to develop design guidelines for the South Island's two development zones. These guidelines would be intended to create a harmonious relationship between the new buildings, the historic buildings and landscapes, and the new landscapes. These guidelines shall also take into account potential shadow impacts resulting from the new buildings to the existing historic properties and character-defining landscape features. Further, when such development has been planned and designed, it is anticipated that it would require land use actions that would be subject to CEQR, and the associated future environmental review would take into account potential impacts to historic resources.

C. REGULATORY CONTEXT

The State Environmental Quality Review Act (SEQRA) requires the consideration of potential impacts to historic resources. In addition, potential effects on historic resources are considered in conformance with the New York State Historic Preservation Act of 1980 (SHPA). The NYCL Law and potential impacts to NYCLs and New York City Historic Districts (NYCHDs) also have been considered.

STATE HISTORIC PRESERVATION ACT

The SHPA closely resembles the National Historic Preservation Act (NHPA) of 1966, and requires that state agencies consider the effect of their actions on properties listed on or determined eligible for listing on the State Register of Historic Places. The requirements of SHPA are set forth in Section 14.09 of the New York State Parks, Recreation and Historic Preservation Law.

NEW YORK CITY LANDMARKS LAW

LPC designates historically significant properties in New York City as NYCLs and/or NYCHDs, following the criteria provided in the Local Laws of the City of New York, New York City Charter, Administrative Code, Title 25, Chapter 3. Properties designated as NYCLs or NYCHDs are protected under the NYCL Law, which requires LPC review and approval before any new construction, alterations, or demolition can occur.

GSA PRESERVATION AND DESIGN MANUAL

As described above, the design guidelines in the Design Manual were intended to be the basis for project review by OPRHP and LPC. As such they lead the design process as well as the reviews of potential impacts to historic resources under SEQRA and SHPA.

D. EXISTING CONDITIONS

ARCHAEOLOGICAL RESOURCES

NORTH ISLAND AREA OF POTENTIAL EFFECT

The potential archaeological sensitivity of the North Island is documented in previous planning studies, the 1998 FEIS, designation reports for the Historic District, and the Design Manual. Portions of the North Island have been determined to be sensitive for both pre-contact and historic-period archaeological resources. The Design Manual includes an archaeological

probability map showing identified and potential archaeological sites within the North Island (see **Figure 8-1**) and notes that:

> "Any project that involves ground disturbing activity, such as building demolition, new construction, the planting of trees, installation of utility lines outside of existing trenches, and similar projects, has the risk of encountering both historic and prehistoric artifacts. Accordingly, all such projects in these areas must be submitted to SHPO [the New York State Historic Preservation Office] for review."

LPC also reviews potential impacts to archaeological resources within the Governors Island Historic District.

Subsequent to the issuance of the Design Manual, a number of reports have been prepared documenting the results of archaeological testing and monitoring of sites and activities on the North Island. The information these reports provide should be used to inform the approach to future projects within the North Island. Significant data resulted from these investigations which can inform, and in some cases supplant, further investigation.

The portions of the North Island which are included in the Proposed Project are listed in **Table 8-1**, discussed further below, and mapped on **Figure 8-2**.

Table 8-1
North Island Project Areas: Potential or Identified Archaeological Sensitivity

North Island Project Area	Design Manual Archaeological Probability Map		
	No Sensitivity	Letter	Identified/Potential Sensitivity Area
Soissons Landing	X	—	—
Yankee Landing & Maintenance Area	X	—	—
Great Promenade	X	—	—
South Battery & Adjacent Areas		J	Original Shoreline
Parade Ground		I	Golf Course, Possible Native American Sites/ Cemetery Sites*
Colonels Row		J	Original Shoreline/ Possible Native American Sites
Nolan Park		H	Site of Former Chapel/ Possible Native American Sites
Liggett Terrace	X	—	—
Governors Island Historic District Buildings		D/E/F/G	Buildings 1, 2 and 9/ Cemetery Sites
Seawall	X	—	—

Notes: *Additional investigations noted.
See Figures 8-1 and 8-2.

Soissons Landing—No Sensitivity

Soissons Landing includes the areas surrounding Building 108, Building 109, Building 110, Building 140, and the area of existing Building 148, which is being demolished in the future without the Proposed Project. It also includes portions of Carder Road, and is adjacent to Soissons Dock itself (Structures 142 and 144). The Design Manual's archaeological probability map does not show the area of proposed excavation as having identified or potential

6.28.11

Plan showing identified and potential archeological sites within the Historic District (Beyer Blinder Belle Consortium)

Archeological Probability Map,
Governors Island Preservation and Design Manual
Figure 8-1

North Island (Coterminous Historic Districts)

South Island

Owned by the National Park Service

Areas of Potential Subsurface Disturbance

0 500 1000 FEET

SCALE

North Island Areas of Potential Subsurface Disturbance

Figure 8-2

archaeological sensitivity. However, OPRHP has recommended that the project's proposed work areas be considered archaeologically sensitive.

Yankee Landing and Maintenance Area—No Sensitivity

The Yankee Landing and Maintenance Area is located on the Island's east side, at Division Road, the boundary between the North Island and South Island. This area is not identified on the Design Manual's archaeological probability map as having identified or potential archaeological sensitivity. However, OPRHP has recommended that the project's proposed work areas be considered archaeologically sensitive.

Great Promenade—No Sensitivity

The Design Manual's archaeological probability map does not identify the proposed areas of excavation for the Great Promenade as having identified or potential archaeological sensitivity. However, OPRHP has recommended that the project's proposed work areas be considered archaeologically sensitive.

South Battery and Adjacent Areas—Area J

The Design Manual's archaeological probability map identifies proposed excavation areas in the vicinity of the South Battery building as "Area J-Original Shoreline," and thus archaeologically sensitive.

Parade Ground—Area I/Cemetery Sites

The Design Manual's archaeological probability map includes the Parade Ground as part of "Area I–Golf Course, Possible Native American Sites," and thus archaeologically sensitive. Two portions of the area are also identified on the Design Manual's archaeological probability map as "Additional Investigations," and the eastern portion of the Parade Ground is identified as "Cemetery Sites." These areas are also considered archaeologically sensitive.

Colonels Row—Area J

The Design Manual's archaeological probability map identifies the open space inside Colonels Row as "Area J–Original Shoreline, Possible Native American Sites," and thus archaeologically sensitive.

Nolan Park—Area H

This open space is identified in the Design Manual's archaeological probability map as "Area H–Site of Former Chapel, Possible Native American Sites," and thus archaeologically sensitive.

Liggett Terrace—No Sensitivity

The Liggett Terrace project area is not identified as a potential area of interest on the Design Manual's archaeological probability map. However, OPRHP has recommended that the project's proposed work areas be considered archaeologically sensitive.

Governors Island Historic District Buildings—Areas D/E/F/G/Cemetery Sites

Some or all of the buildings within the Governors Island Historic District could be utilized for the Later Phases-Island Redevelopment component of the Proposed Project. The Design Manual's archaeological probability map identifies the following Historic District buildings as potential areas of interest: the Governor's House (Area E-Quarters/Building 2); the Admiral's

House (Area D-Quarters/Building 1); the Block House (Area F-Building 9); and the area around the South Battery—Building 298 (Area G-Original Shoreline).[1] Thus, these areas are considered archaeologically sensitive. Other than these areas, the buildings within the Governors Island Historic District (excluding those in the Governors Island National Monument) are not identified as having potential archaeological sensitivity.

Seawall—No Sensitivity

The Island's seawall is not identified in the Design Manual as having potential archaeological sensitivity. However, OPRHP and LPC have recommended that areas adjacent to the seawall be considered archaeologically sensitive (see **Appendix B**).

SOUTH ISLAND AREA OF POTENTIAL EFFECT

South Island, which comprises approximately 80 acres south of Division Road, was created between 1901 and 1912 from fill material from the excavation of the Lexington Avenue subway line. Therefore, this portion of the island is not considered to be potentially archaeologically sensitive. The South Island is not included in the Governors Island Historic District.

OFF-ISLAND AREA OF POTENTIAL EFFECT

The off-Island areas of potential effect for the Proposed Project extend (1) from the vicinity of Building 85 on the North Island under Buttermilk Channel and across the Red Hook Container Terminal to New York City Department of Environmental Protection (NYCDEP) vaults at the intersection of Van Brunt Street and Sackett, Union, or President Streets (exact location to be determined); and (2) from near Half Moon Road on the South Island to the corner of Sullivan and Conover Streets in Brooklyn (see **Figure 8-3**). In Brooklyn, Sullivan Street from Conover Street to Ferris Street would also be affected, entirely within New York City Department of Transportation (DOT) right-of-way.

LPC and OPRHP were consulted regarding the potential archaeological sensitivity of these areas of potential effect (see **Appendix B**). LPC determined that the Alignment No. 2 work—from Conover and Sullivan Streets in Red Hook, Brooklyn and the south end of Governors Island—would not be likely to impact significant archaeological resources in Brooklyn or Governors Island. LPC also determined that the portion of Alignment No. 1 work that would occur in Brooklyn, and the proposed work in the Buttermilk Channel, would not be likely to impact significant archaeological resources. OPRHP concurred with LPC's comments.

ARCHITECTURAL RESOURCES

NORTH ISLAND PROJECT AREA

As described above, the Proposed Project would involve changes to a number of sites within the 80-acre portion of the North Island, which is administered by The Trust and which is part of the Governors Island Historic District (see **Figure 8-4**). Portions of the North Island to be altered by the Proposed Project are listed below and in **Table 8-2**.

The Design Manual classifies each of the buildings and sites within the Historic District based on their individual historic and architectural significance. The categories are as follows:

---

[1] The Design Manual's archaeological probability map inaccurately denotes Area F as "Building 2" rather than "Building 9", and Area G as "Building 9" rather than "Original Shoreline."

6.28.11

Project Area

Governors Island National Monument

Architectural Resources Study Area (50-foot Perimeter)

12″ *Existing Water Main*

12″ *Proposed Water Main*

0 1000 FEET
SCALE

PROPOSED PHASED REDEVELOPMENT OF
GOVERNORS ISLAND

Off-Island Existing and Proposed Water Mains
Figure 8-3

6.28.11

Category 1

Category 2

Category 3

Category 4

Governors Island Preservation and Design Manual,
Map of Resources within Historic District
Figure 8-4

- Category 1: Properties are individually listed in the National Register of Historic Places, or have been designated as individual landmarks by LPC, and contribute to the significance of the Governors Island Historic District.
- Category 2: Properties are contributing resources within the National Historic Landmark and the NYCHD Governors Island Historic District.
- Category 3: Properties are non-contributing elements within the National Historic Landmark and the NYCHD Governors Island Historic District.
- Category 4: Properties are intrusions into the NYCHD Governors Island Historic District.[1]

It should be noted that the Design Manual's map and accompanying tables are occasionally inconsistent in the categorization and identification of properties. Where relevant for this analysis, these inconsistencies are noted below. **Table 8-2** below also indicates the categorization of the properties on the North Island as noted in the LPC designation report and S/NR nomination for the Historic District.

Table 8-2
Historic Resources within North Island Project Areas

North Island Project Area	Adjacent Structures	Structure Number	Design Manual Category	Design Manual Status	S/NR Status	NYCL Status
Soissons Landing	Marshall Hall	108[2]	2	Contributing	Non-contributing	District Level
	Administrative Offices	109[1]	2	Contributing	Non-contributing	District Level
	Storage Depot	110	2	Contributing	Contributing	District Level
	Storehouse	140	2	Contributing	Contributing	District Level
	Soissons Dock	142/144[3]	3	Non-contributing	Non-contributing	District Level
	Ferry Waiting Building	148[1,4]	2	Contributing	Non-contributing	District Level
Yankee Landing & Maintenance Area	School	301	2	Contributing	Contributing	District Level
	Catholic Chapel	309[3]	3	Non-contributing	Non-contributing	District Level
	Family Housing	315	2	Contributing	Contributing	District Level
	YMCA	324	2	Contributing	Contributing	District Level
	Theater	330	2	Contributing	Contributing	District Level
	Detachment Barracks	333	2	Contributing	Contributing	District Level

[1] There are four structures noted as Category 4 in the Design Manual: Structures 91/95 and Buildings 134, 513, and 293. The Design Manual's historic resources map identifies Soissons Dock as Structures 91/95 [Omaha Dock], and as Category 4 resources; however, the accompanying table and building inventory pages identify Soissons Dock as Structures 142/144, and as Category 3 resources. Building 293 was demolished in 2008.

[2] The Design Manual's historic resources map identifies Buildings 108, 109, and 148 as Category 3 resources; however, the accompanying building inventory pages identify these structures as Category 2 resources.

[3] The Design Manual's historic resources map identifies Soissons Dock as Structures 91/95 [Omaha Dock], and as Category 4 resources; however, the accompanying table and building inventory pages identify Soissons Dock as Structures 142/144, and as Category 3 resources.

[4] These buildings are due to be demolished in the Future Without the Proposed Project.

Table 8-2 (cont'd)
Historic Resources within North Island Project Areas

North Island Project Area	Adjacent Structures	Structure Number	Design Manual Category	Design Manual Status	S/NR Status	NYCL Status
Great Promenade	Various[1]	—	—	—	—	—
South Battery & Adjacent Areas	Officers' Housing	12	2	Contributing	Contributing	District Level
	Chapel of St. Cornelius	13	2	Contributing	Contributing	District Level
	South Battery	298[2]	2	Contributing	Contributing	District Level
	School	301	2	Contributing	Contributing	District Level
Parade Ground	Glacis/Parade Ground	—	2	Contributing	Contributing	District Level
	Chapel of St. Cornelius	13	2	Contributing	Contributing	District Level
	Company Officers' Quarters	14-17	2	Contributing	Contributing	District Level
	South Battery	298	2	Contributing	Contributing	District Level
	Catholic Chapel	309[3]	3	Non-contributing	Non-contributing	District Level
	Officer's Housing	403	2	Contributing	Contributing	District Level
Colonels Row	Colonels Row Green	—	2	Contributing	Contributing	District Level
	Liggett Hall	400	2	Contributing	Contributing	District Level
	Officer's Housing, BOQ	406-410	2	Contributing	Contributing	District Level
	Post Hospital	515	2	Contributing	Contributing	District Level
	Medical Clinic	517	3	Non-contributing	Non-contributing	District Level
	Admiral's House	1	1	Individually listed	Individual	Individual
	Governor's House	2[5]	2	Individually listed	Individual	Individual
	Dutch House	3	2	Contributing	Contributing	District Level
	Field Officer's Quarters	4-5	2	Contributing	Contributing	District Level
	Company Officer's Quarters	6-8, 10[5]	2	Contributing	Contributing	District Level
	Block House	9	1	Individually listed	Individual	Individual
	Steward's Quarters	11	2	Contributing	Contributing	District Level
	Chapel of St. Cornelius	13	2	Contributing	Contributing	District Level
	Company Officers' Quarters	14-19	2	Contributing	Contributing	District Level
	Officer's Quarters	20	2	Contributing	Contributing	District Level
	Ordinance Storehouse	25	2	Contributing	Contributing	District Level
Liggett Terrace	Liggett Hall	400	2	Contributing	Contributing	District Level
Seawall	—	—	—	—	—	—

[1] See Figure 8-2 for details.

[2] The Design Manual's historic resources map identifies Buildings 2, 10, and 298 as Category 1 resources; however, the accompanying building inventory pages identify these structures as Category 2 resources.

Soissons Landing—Category 2/3

Soissons Landing includes the areas surrounding Building 108, Building 109, Building 110, Building 140, and the area of existing Building 148, which is being demolished in the future without the Proposed Project. It also includes portions of Carder Road, and is adjacent to Soissons Dock itself (Structures 142 and 144).

Building 108 is a two-story, brick Neo-Georgian style office building. A raking wood cornice defines the building's roofline. The primary entrance, on the south elevation, is flanked by Tuscan columns supporting a flat entablature. A modern, elevated deck is situated along the north wing. Building 108 is surrounded by concrete walkways and sloped grassy areas, and—according to the Design Manual—has no significant site features requiring preservation.

Building 109 is a rectangular-plan, one-story utilitarian brick office and storage building that rests on a raised stone basement. It was originally constructed in wood in 1918 and rebuilt in brick after 1945. The building has a double-gable roof form sheathed in asphalt shingles and penetrated by two chimneys. It is one of the last buildings constructed for the New York Arsenal on the Island and was used to store ammunition prepared for army use during World War I. Building 109 is surrounded by paved roadways, concrete roadways, and sloped grassy areas containing several mature trees. Brick retaining walls line the roadways around the building. According to the Design Manual, the mature trees and brickwork surrounding Building 109 should be preserved and maintained.

Building 110 was constructed between 1870 and 1879 to house obsolete Civil War munitions for the New York Arsenal. It was converted for office use during World War I and contained offices through the remainder of the U.S. Army and Coast Guard periods. The building is two and a half stories tall and Romanesque Revival in style. It is clad in brick and has a shallow-pitch gable roof. Building 110 is surrounded by paved parking lots and roadways, concrete walkways, and sloped grassy areas containing mature trees. The building has excellent views of lower Manhattan. According to the Design Manual, the trees and view are important features to be preserved and maintained.

Building 140 is a highly ornamented, one-story Romanesque Revival style building with a cross-gable, asphalt shingle roof. It was constructed between 1857 and 1867 to store ordnance; more recently, the Coast Guard used the building for the Island's bank, post office, and security offices. The building is of masonry bearing wall construction with brick walls resting on a brownstone water table. The main building is rectangular in plan and is intersected by a small, central wing on the north elevation. The roof has overhanging eaves with closely spaced brackets above a raking, denticulated, painted-brick cornice. Building 140 is surrounded by asphalt paving to the south and west with some small grassy areas around its perimeter. According to the Design Manual, mature trees adjacent to the building should be preserved and maintained.

Structures 142 and 144 of Soissons Dock are ferry landings made of timber piers that have steel gantry structures at their land ends. The present ferry slip structure dates from 1947. As mentioned above, the Design Manual's historic resources map incorrectly identifies Soissons Dock as Structures 91/95 [Omaha Dock], and as Category 4 resources; however, the accompanying table and building inventory pages correctly identify Soissons Dock as Structures 142/144, and as Category 3 resources.

As noted above, Building 148 would be demolished in the future without the Proposed Project. This one-story red brick structure was constructed in 1917 to provide waiting facilities for the

ferry service. It is surrounded by asphalt on all sides and has no significant landscape or site features.

Yankee Landing and Maintenance Area—No Classification/Category 2/3

As described above, Yankee Landing is located on the Island's east side, at Division Road, which is the boundary between the historic North Island and the non-historic South Island. Yankee Pier/Yankee Landing is not classified as a historic resource in the Design Manual

Some of the roadways and pedestrian walkways between Yankee Landing, the Parade Ground, and the South Battery are within the Proposed Project's area of potential effect. Specifically, these are the areas surrounding Buildings 301, 315, 324, 330, and 333, and the area of existing Building 309, which is being demolished in the future without the Proposed Project.

Building 301 is described below under "South Battery & Adjacent Areas—Category 2."

Building 309 was built as Our Lady Star of the Sea Catholic chapel circa 1942, during the Army base's World War II expansion. It is a one-story rectangular frame structure covered with vinyl siding. As described above, Building 309 is being demolished in the future without the Proposed Project.

Building 315, built in 1938-1940, is a 3½-story, rectangular-shaped Neo-Georgian-style structure, constructed of red brick with cast stone accents at the entrance and sills. It was designed by the firm of McKim, Mead & White and is typical of the residential buildings built by the Army in the 1930s to accommodate the permanent military community on the Island. Building 315 is surrounded by concrete and asphalt paving, but mature trees are located along the southern edge of the building, edging Craig Road South. The Design Manual notes that this landscaping should be preserved and maintained.

Building 324 was designed by the firm of May and Hillard. Built in 1926 as the Fort Jay YMCA, it was the first of the large brick buildings constructed between the wars. It is a rectangular, red brick Neo-Georgian-style structure with a two-story central section flanked by ones-story wings. A limestone beltcourse bearing the date "1926" marks the foundation. The Design Manual notes that the mature trees and landscaping surrounding the building should be preserved. A swimming pool to the rear of the building would be removed in the future without the Proposed Project.

Building 330 is a two-story Neo-Georgian-style theater faced with brick laid in American bond. It was constructed between 1937 and1939 and is typical of theaters constructed on military bases during that period. Building 330 is surrounded by concrete and asphalt paving, which have no significance; however, the Design Manual notes that the mature trees located within grassy plots around the building should be preserved.

Building 333 is a three-story Neo-Georgian style structure arranged in a U-shaped plan and constructed of brick on a sandstone/concrete foundation. A central projection contains an entrance porch composed of stone columns and pilasters supporting an iron balustrade. The building was constructed in 1932, along with Building 550, as barracks for enlisted men. These two buildings flank Liggett Hall (see description below) and are very similar to it in general design features. The Design Manual notes that the brick sidewalks and mature landscaping surrounding the building should be preserved.

Great Promenade—Various

The Great Promenade—the roadway that follows the seawall around the entire Island—is not classified as a historic resource in the Design Manual. It is, however, adjacent to a number of contributing structures within the Historic District.

South Battery & Adjacent Areas—Category 2

The South Battery and Adjacent Area includes area in front of Buildings 12, 13, 298, and 301.

Building 12 is a four and a half story Neo-Georgian style building composed of fifteen sections, located overlooking Buttermilk Channel. The central portion of the building forms a large U-shaped courtyard facing the water. The building was constructed in 1931 by the Army's Construction Division of the Office of the Quartermaster General and designed by McKim, Mead & White. It served as officer's quarters and family housing from 1931 to 1997. Building 12 is surrounded by concrete and asphalt paving, which can be removed or modified. Mature trees are located within grassy plots around the building. The Design Manual notes that these trees should be preserved.

Building 13, the Chapel of St. Cornelius, is a two-story church clad in rock-face limestone. It was constructed in 1905 and designed by Charles C. Haight in the Neo-Gothic style. The building is roughly cruciform in plan, with a substantial three-story tower at the northwest corner providing the primary entrance. Steep intersecting gables are covered with slate with copper gutters, ridges, and flashing. Most windows are lancet arched with ornamental carved limestone tracery. Building 13 is bordered by asphalt paving to the south and west and is surrounded by small grassy areas. According to the Design Manual, the paved areas can be removed and replaced, while any mature landscaping should be preserved.

Building 298, the South Battery, is located toward the southern portion of the Historic District on the east side of the Island. The South Battery was built in 1812 as a defense against enemy ships entering Buttermilk Channel. What is now Building 298 began as a single-story barracks structure with a slate gable roof built within the original fortification in the 1840s. Prior to 1863, a second story was added, and the building occupied by noncommissioned staff. In 1878 the structure became the Officers' Mess hall and Catholic Chapel. The building was remodeled in 1904 and converted into an amusement hall and lecture room for enlisted men. Between 1936 and 1937, the WPA rebuilt the second floor as The Corbin Dining Hall. In 1939 the building became the Officer's Club. The historic fort is surrounded by a 10,100-square-foot asphalt surface. The Design Manual notes that any mature trees and landscaping surrounding the South Battery property should be preserved and maintained. The remaining Battery walls and fortification elements, including historic archaeological remains, are important preservation issues. The scale of the building and its orientation between Fort Jay and Buttermilk Channel are important aspects that should be preserved.

Building 301 was constructed in 1934 when the Island's army base expanded to accommodate the needs of the 16th Regiment. Designed by Eric Kibbon, this school is a one-story Neo-Georgian style structure with a modified L plan. The central section of the building has an asphalt-covered pyramidal roof with a cupola and a projecting pedimented entrance pavilion on the north side. Wings at the east and north were added in 1959-1960. Building 301 is surrounded by concrete and asphalt roads and walkways, and mature trees are located within grassy plots around the building. The Design Manual notes that mature trees and landscapes around the building should be preserved.

Parade Ground—Category 2/3

Fort Jay's Glacis (a slope running down from a fortification) is a fairly uniform grass area slightly sloping down from the Island's central fort. The introduction of buildings during the 19th and 20th centuries has interrupted the unimpeded access to the shoreline, but the character of the feature remains, especially on the west and south sides of the Fort. The Glacis (including what was defined as the Parade Ground) was defined in the LPC Governors Island Historic District report as "one of the important landscape features (which) clearly reflect the Island's development patterns and spatial relationships." The Design Manual notes that this open space is important to understanding the evolution of development on the Island. The open lawn area is its primary character-defining feature.

The Parade Ground is a 12-acre lawn on the south-facing Glacis, located between Nolan Park and Colonels Row. It extends to the forecourt of the South Battery. The southern end of the Parade Ground was the post cemetery until 1889, when the cemetery was moved to Cypress Hills, Queens, as a result of new construction in that area of the Island. Like all military parade grounds, it was central to garrison life on Governors Island, functioning as both training and ceremonial space on a regular basis. In the post World War II years, the Parade Ground was the setting for various anniversary celebrations, which often featured historic battle reenactments.

Structures adjacent to the portion of the Parade Ground that would be affected by the Proposed Project are Buildings 13-17 (described below under "Nolan Park—Category 1/2"), Building 298 (described above under "South Battery & Adjacent Areas—Category 2"), and the area of existing Building 309 (described above under "Yankee Landing and Maintenance Area—No Classification/Category 2/3"), which is being demolished in the future without the Proposed Project. Building 293—a structure near the Parade Ground which is identified on the Design Manual map as a Category 4 resource—was demolished in 2008.

Colonels Row—Category 2/3

The Colonels Row project area includes areas surrounding Liggett Hall (discussed below under "Liggett Terrace—Category 2"), Buildings 406-410, 515, and 517, and Colonels Row Green.

Colonels Row (Buildings 403-410) is a group of eight brick houses built along Hay Road around the turn of the century. The residences were constructed according to standardized plans of the Quartermaster General. They are clad in red brick and are Colonial Revival in style. The rear facades of the Colonels Row buildings face the Parade Ground; the front facades face Colonels Row Green. The buildings are surrounded by sloped brick walkways and mature trees, which the Design Manual notes should be preserved.

Building 515, the Post Hospital, was constructed in 1935 and designed by McKim, Mead, and White. It was subsequently converted for use as enlisted bachelor's housing. Building 515 is composed of a central four-story gable-roofed section with three-story flanking wings with hipped roofs, built in the Neo-Georgian style. The building is surrounded by non-historic concrete and asphalt paving. The design Manual notes that the mature trees located within grassy plots around the building should be maintained.

Building 517 is a one-story frame structure attached by an enclosed walkway to the south side of Building 515. It was constructed circa 1942 as a "temporary" medical clinic, and was later used as a dental clinic by the Coast Guard.

Colonels Row Green is a relatively small, triangular, park-like space between Hay Road and Clayton Road. This area contains mature trees, grass, and brick walkways. Colonels Row Green

sits on landfill, just south of the Island's original shoreline. It is thought to be work carried out through the WPA during the late 1930s. Colonels Row Green and Nolan Park (see below) are defined in LPC's Governors Island Historic District report (1996) as two of the "important landscape features (which) clearly reflect the Island's development patterns and spatial relationships." The Design Manual notes that "the open spaces defined as Nolan Park and Colonels Row Green are important to understanding the evolution of development on the Island. The brick walkways and mature trees lining those walkways are defining features, as are the uncluttered lawn areas."

Nolan Park—Category 1/2

The Nolan Park project area includes Nolan Park and areas surrounding Building 11, Building13 (described above under "South Battery & Adjacent Areas—Category 2"), Buildings 14-20, and Building 25. Buildings 1-10 also front onto Nolan Park. Although they are not within the Nolan Park project area, they are included here to fully describe the Nolan Park context.

Nolan Park, a four-acre lawn with mature trees, was named for Major General Dennis E. Nolan, Commander of the First Army from 1933 to 1936. It provided a park-like setting for the administrative buildings and officers' housing built there throughout the 19th century. The park is transected by brick pedestrian walkways; brick sidewalks also line the edges of the park open space and mature trees. The park's present configuration dates to at least the 1870s. The park contains military artifacts, commemorative markers, and a wide variety of trees, many of which are quite large and may date to the Island's very early history.

Building 1 is the Admiral's House, also formerly known as the Commanding General's Quarters. It was constructed in 1843 and designed in the Greek Revival style by architect Martin E. Thompson. This two-story house is located at the north end of Nolan Park.

Building 2 is the Governor's House, located to the north of the Admiral's House near Building 25. Built circa 1813, this is the oldest habitable structure on Governors Island. It was the original guardhouse for the Island and was subsequently converted in 1824 for use as the commanding officers quarters.

Building 3 is located between Buildings 1 and 3 at the north end of Nolan Park. This two-story, two-family utilitarian structure was built circa 1846 as a storehouse for the commissary and the quartermaster. Its stepped gable ends have caused it to be known as the Dutch House.

Buildings 4 and 5 are Field Officer's Quarters. They were built ca. 1857, at the same time as the first field officer's housing on the Island, and served as the models for the small-scale wood frame residential buildings that were built during the remainder of the 19th century and that enclose most of the space at Nolan Park.

Buildings 6-8 and 10 are Company Officer's Quarters, built in 1878. Buildings 6 and 7 were built as a matched pair. They are two and a half story, T-shaped, Victorian Vernacular style wood frame houses on painted brick foundation walls.

Building 9 is a red brick, two-story Greek Revival style structure set on a high basement of schist and brick. Sometimes known as the Block House, this structure was originally built in 1839 as the Post Hospital for the Fort Columbus Garrison. Building 9 is located at the southeastern edge of Nolan Park.

Building 11, the former Steward's Quarters, is a small single-family, one-story wood frame house set on a high brick basement. This vernacular style building, built in 1878, has wood

tongue-and-groove siding and a low gabled roof covered with asphalt shingles. A full width porch with simple posts and railings and a shallow hipped roof runs along the north front façade of the structure. Building 11 forms the southern closure of Nolan Park.

Buildings 14-18, which were constructed in 1879 to an identical standardized plan, are two stories tall and Victorian Vernacular in style. They are single-family houses built of wood frame construction on brick foundation walls. These buildings face Nolan Park and are surrounded by sloped brick walkways and driveways and mature trees, which the Design Manual notes are important elements to preserve.

Building 19 is a two-family, two and a half story Victorian Vernacular style house built of wood frame construction on brick foundation walls. It was built in 1891 as a double unit for Company Officer's Quarters. Octagonal additions date to 1902, as do porch extensions. As with Buildings 14-18, Building 19 faces Nolan Park and is surrounded by sloped brick walkways and driveways and mature trees, which the Design Manual notes are important elements to preserve.

Building 20 (Officer's Quarters), located at the northern end of Nolan Park, was the last structure built on the park. With Buildings 15–19, it forms the western edge of Nolan Park. It is a two-story Victorian/Colonial Revival-style housing structure, originally built as a large, single-family officer's quarters in 1902–1904 and rehabilitated for two families in 1936–1938. The 1930s renovations included reconfiguring the porch, removal of the south bay, and removal of decorative brackets and dentils from the eaves. The building's exterior was restored in 1986. The main building is a rectangular-shaped three-story wood frame structure covered with wood clapboards. The Design Manual notes that Building 20 is surrounded by sloped brick and slate walkways and driveways and mature trees, which are important site features that should be preserved and maintained.

Building 25, a former Ordnance Storehouse, is a long, narrow utilitarian structure constructed of brick masonry bearing walls. There are two stories on the south façade and three on the north. A cantilevered, wood-frame with white-painted clapboard siding addition has been built onto the second floor along the long southern flank facing Nolan Park. The original section of the building dates to 1811, and was constructed to accompany the newly rebuilt Fort Columbus, the masonry fort (later renamed Fort Jay) that replaced the original earthworks of old Fort Jay. Building 25 is surrounded by sloped brick walkways and driveways, and mature trees are located around the building. The Design Manual notes that these are important site elements that should be preserved and maintained.

Liggett Terrace—Category 2

Designed as the centerpiece of McKim Mead and White's 1930s "Island Beautiful" plan, Liggett Hall is a massive, U-shaped Neo-Georgian structure that transverses the Island. It was completed in 1930, and at that time housed the entire 16th Infantry, some 1,375 soldiers. Liggett Hall was erected just south of the former southwestern shoreline of the Island and was the first permanent structure built entirely on landfill. The central block of Liggett Hall is covered by a steeply pitched slate-covered gable roof, and the four corner pavilions each have a cupola. Prominent paired end chimneys are present on either end of the central block. Extending from the central block are three-story wings with two-story galleries that line the courtyard façades. Simple, slightly projecting portico entrances lead into each wing. Liggett Hall's most distinctive feature is the Arch, the monumental archway that connects the Governors Island Historic District public spaces to a four-acre open area of lawns and parking lots. This space, enclosed on three sides by Liggett Hall, is the site of the proposed Liggett Terrace.

According to the Design Manual, exterior elements of the building that should be preserved include the formal design, its scale and form; brick masonry walls; stone detailing; the central cupola; slate chimney; monumental sallyport; paired end chimneys; pedimented entrances; location of window and door openings; and the galleries. Any new construction in this area must take into consideration the original design intent of the building, its scale, and detailing. The mature trees and historic monuments located around the building also should be preserved. Site constraints prevent additions to be placed on the north, east, or south portions of the building; however, previously constructed additions within the building's west courtyard are inappropriate in scale and design and can be removed.

Seawall—No Classification

The seawall enclosing the North Island is not classified as a historic resource in the Design Manual. The *Cultural Landscape Report for Governors Island National Monument*, prepared in 2010 by the National Park Service and the Olmstead Center for Landscape Preservation, provides some detail on the chronology of bulkhead construction throughout the Island's development. As described in that report, the North Island's seawall, which has been repaired over time, was primarily constructed in the 1880s to early 1900s. Portions of the seawall have been repaired during the Trust's stewardship of the Island.

Landscape

The Design Manual notes the following regarding the Historic District's landscape:

> "Although the Governors Island Historic District was not designed with a unified landscape concept or plan, simple patterns have been developed over the years. These vary from tree-lined streets and walkways to park settings. Each is important within its defined physical environment, and as a contributing part of the Historic District. Those patterns should be preserved and maintained, and used as a guide for new development."
>
> "Landscaping has been used on Governors Island to place emphasis on the patterns created by walkways, open spaces, buildings, and recreational areas, and to enhance the quality of the living environment. Within the Governors Island Historic District, it is vital to recognize and preserve landscape elements and patterns that are historically and aesthetically important in defining the character of the resource. These can be found in the use of plant and paving materials, lighting and site features, as well as the specific design and placement of those elements. All contribute to the overall quality of the Historic District."

The Design Manual provides specific guidelines for landscaping and site development.

SOUTH ISLAND PROJECT AREA

OPRHP and LPC have previously determined that the portion of the Island south of Division Road does not contain any architectural resources.

ON-ISLAND STUDY AREA

The on-Island study area consists of the Governors Island National Monument, a 22-acre area administered by the NPS that includes Fort Jay and Castle Williams. Both Fort Jay and Castle Williams are individually designated NYCLs.

Fort Jay, originally Fort Columbus, is located on Andes Road. An earthen fortification known as Fort Jay was erected on this site as part of the earliest attempt to fortify New York Harbor. In 1806 this was replaced by Fort Columbus, the current star-shaped structure that was inspired by

French fortifications. The fort was designed by Lieutenant Colonel Jonathan Williams, who had lived in France in 1776–85 under the auspices of his great-uncle, Benjamin Franklin. The sandstone structure has four bastions enclosed by a dry moat. The entrance is crowned by a large sandstone trophy sculpture with an eagle and military symbols. The interior of the fort contains Greek Revival barracks with colonnaded porticoes that were constructed in 1834–36. The fort was renamed for John Jay in 1904.

Castle Williams, on Hay Road, is a massive bastion forming three-fifths of a circle, with a two-story entrance pavilion filling in the remainder of the form. Erected to support more than 100 cannons, it is one of a series of forts built to fortify New York as tensions rose between America and the British in the early 19th century. At the time of its construction it served as a prototype for seacoast fortifications in America. The fort served as a prison for Confederate soldiers during the Civil War, and was later used as quarters for new recruits, as a military prison, and as storage. The three-tiered fort is constructed of red Newark sandstone, and its walls are eight feet thick at the base and seven feet thick at the top.

OFF-ISLAND PROJECT AREAS AND STUDY AREA

The off-Island project areas extend (1) from the vicinity of Building 85 on the North Island under Buttermilk Channel and across the Red Hook Container Terminal to NYCDEP vaults at the intersection of Van Brunt Street and Sackett, Union, or President Streets (exact location to be determined); and (2) from near Half Moon Road on the South Island to the corner of Sullivan and Conover Streets in Brooklyn (see Figure 8-3). In Brooklyn, Sullivan Street from Conover Street to Ferris Street within DOT right-of-way is also included in the project area. To account for potential visual and contextual effects to architectural resources, a 50-foot study area around these off-Island project areas has been identified (see Figure 8-3).

No designated architectural resources are located within the off-Island project areas or study areas. There is one potential architectural resource within the off-Island study area. The brick industrial building complex at 43 Ferris Street (Block 564, Lot 1) was constructed ca. 1925 at the intersection of Sullivan and Ferris Streets. The building complex includes four structures, including a former foundry and machine shop. Starting in 1926, it was owned by the Segal Lock and Hardware Company, a leading manufacturer of hardware merchandise and razor blades in the 1920s and 1930s.

E. FUTURE WITHOUT THE PROPOSED PROJECT

In the Future without the Proposed Project, it is assumed that Governors Island will continue to operate in 2013 and 2030 much as it does today. The North Island would continue to be made accessible to the public on designated visitation days. Vacant historic buildings within the Governors Island Historic District would remain vacant. South Island will contain a mix of open space uses and vacant land. Demolition of existing buildings on South Island and a handful of buildings on the North Island was approved in 2008 and is expected to be completed. Structures to be demolished on the North Island include Buildings 148 and 309. The swimming pool adjacent to Building 324 and two of the additions within the west courtyard of Building 400 also would be removed.

As described in Chapter 2, “Analytical Framework,” The Trust is also undertaking several projects to rehabilitate, repair, replace, and upgrade utility and waterfront infrastructure on the Island in the future without the Proposed Project. The utility infrastructure work includes on-Island replacement and upgrade to the following services: storm sewer, including consolidating

outfalls; domestic and fire protection water service; sanitary sewer; and electrical and telecommunications service (also includes upgrades of service to the Island). The waterfront infrastructure work includes rehabilitation of both Pier 101 and Yankee Pier, demolition of Tango Pier, and rehabilitation of the transfer bridges and fenders at both Soissons Dock and the Battery Maritime Building. The Battery Maritime Building is a New York City Landmark and is listed on the State and National Registers of Historic Places; thus, the rehabilitation and new construction underway at this building is being reviewed and approved under the New York City Landmarks Law on an ongoing basis. No projects have been identified within the off-Island study areas.

Architectural resources that are listed on the National Register or that have been found eligible for listing are given a measure of protection from the effects of federally sponsored or assisted projects under Section 106 of the National Historic Preservation Act. Although preservation is not mandated, federal agencies must attempt to avoid adverse impacts on such resources through a notice, review, and consultation process. Properties listed on the State Register are similarly protected against impacts resulting from state-sponsored or state-assisted projects under SHPA. Private property owners using private funds can, however, alter or demolish their properties without such a review process. Privately owned sites that are NYCLs, within NYCHDs, or pending designation, are protected under the New York City Landmarks Law, which requires LPC review and approval before any alteration or demolition can occur.

F. PROBABLE IMPACTS OF THE PROPOSED PROJECT

PHASE 1 (2013)

ARCHAEOLOGICAL RESOURCES

North Island Area of Potential Effect

Soissons Landing—No Sensitivity

Phase 1 of the Proposed Project would redesign the area upland of Soissons Dock and the areas surrounding Buildings 108, 109, 110, and 140 into a series of public plazas (see Figure 1-4 in Chapter 1, “Project Description”). No in-water work would be required at Soissons Dock itself. Building 148 is being demolished in the future without the Proposed Project; however, its former area would experience some subsurface disturbance for the Proposed Project.

Coordination with LPC and/or OPRHP (as appropriate) will be conducted to determine the need for any additional work for this area. The protocol for all excavations planned in the Historic District would be as follows. Plans for any excavations in the Historic District will be submitted to LPC and/or OPRHP, and the agency(ies) will make recommendations as to whether any archaeological work is needed. If work is required, an archaeological work plan will be submitted from an accredited archaeologist, to be reviewed and approved by LPC and/or OPRHP (as appropriate). Upon completion of the pre-approved excavation within these areas, an archaeological summary report will be sent to LPC and/or OPHRP. LPC and/or OPRHP (as appropriate) will be informed immediately if any artifacts are identified during excavations at any location within the Historic District.

South Battery & Adjacent Areas—Area J

The 10,100-square-foot asphalt surface around the South Battery would be replaced with lawn, trees, shrubs, and seating areas (see Figure 1-6). This would create a new resting place along the

Great Promenade and provide seating and amenities in a location that would showcase the historic fort. No changes would be made to or within the South Battery building itself.

Coordination with LPC and/or OPRHP (as appropriate) will be conducted to determine the need for any additional work for this area. As necessary, additional work would be conducted according to the protocol described above. Therefore, the Phase 1 work proposed for this area would not be anticipated to have any adverse impacts to archaeological resources.

Parade Ground—Area I/Cemetery Sites

The Parade Ground would be improved to support both active and passive recreation. Toward the southern end of the Parade Ground, the lawn would be regraded to support two flat fields for soccer and other field sports, and lighting would be installed along its perimeter (see Figure 1-6). It is assumed that these changes would require subsurface disturbance of some or all of the Parade Ground.

As described above, the Design Manual's archaeological probability map includes the Parade Ground as part of "Area I–Golf Course, Possible Native American Sites," "Additional Investigations," and "Cemetery Sites." Therefore, coordination with LPC and/or OPRHP (as appropriate) will be conducted to determine the need for any additional work for this area. As necessary, additional work would be conducted according to the protocol described above.

Colonels Row—Area J

The Colonels Row Green area would have limited improvements (tree uplighting and, potentially, irrigation and drainage improvements) to support ongoing uses as festival grounds and concert venue. It is assumed for the purposes of a conservative analysis that these limited improvements would involve subsurface disturbance to a portion or all of the green. As described above, the Design Manual's archaeological probability map identifies the open space inside Colonels Row as "Area J–Original Shoreline, Possible Native American Sites." Therefore, coordination with LPC and/or OPRHP (as appropriate) will be conducted to determine the need for any additional work for this area. As necessary, additional work would be conducted according to the protocol described above.

Nolan Park—Area H

With the Proposed Project, the Nolan Park area would be enhanced with selective plantings, tree uplighting, regrading a pathway to create an ADA-accessible route through Nolan Park, and improving the connection between Evans Road and Andes Road at the border with the Parade Ground. The Design Manual's archaeological probability map shows the proposed excavation area as having identified or potential archaeological sensitivity. Therefore, coordination with LPC and/or OPRHP (as appropriate) will be conducted to determine the need for any additional work for this area. As necessary, additional work would be conducted according to the protocol described above.

Liggett Terrace—No Sensitivity

With the Proposed Project, the existing parking lot area south of Liggett Hall would be transformed into Liggett Terrace, a public plaza with flower beds, mosaics, labyrinthic hedges, fountains, public art, seating areas, concession stands, and a children's play area with climbing and swinging equipment and reflecting pools (see Figure 1-7). Subsurface disturbance of the entire four-acre area is assumed to be required.

This area has not been identified in previous studies as having potential archaeological sensitivity; however, has recommended that the project's proposed work areas be considered archaeologically sensitive. Therefore, coordination with LPC and/or OPRHP (as appropriate) will be conducted to determine the need for any additional work for this area. As necessary, additional work would be conducted according to the protocol described above.

Seawall—No Sensitivity

A variety of methods would be used to repair or replace the Island's seawall, depending on its condition. A majority of the rehabilitation work on the North Island would consist of repair or replacement, maintaining the existing footprint and design (see Figure 1-14). A portion of the seawall between Division Road and Hay Road, including the entire length adjacent to Castle Williams, would undergo full replacement using an augmented design to respond to challenging wave conditions. As requested by LPC and OPRHP, construction plans for any work adjacent to the seawall will be reviewed by LPC and/or OPRHP (as appropriate), to determine if archaeology would be appropriate.

South Island Area of Potential Effect

As described above, the South Island is not considered to be potentially archaeologically sensitive. Therefore, the activity and subsurface disturbance that would occur on this portion of the Island in Phase 1 would not affect archaeological resources.

Off Island Area of Potential Effect

Phase 1 of the Proposed Project would include construction of one or both of the two 12-inch water mains from Brooklyn to provide potable water to the Island. The water main(s) would connect from NYCDEP vaults on Sackett, Union, or President Streets at the intersection of Van Brunt Street, and at the corner of Sullivan and Conover Streets, under Buttermilk Channel to the existing island water infrastructure in the vicinity of Building 85 (a Category 3/non-contributing structure) on the North Island and near Half Moon Road on the South Island where the new main(s) would connect with the existing water distribution system of the Island. Lay-down areas for the water main construction also would be in the vicinity of Building 85 and Half Moon Road.

Although the actual tie-in locations would be contingent upon access agreements and rights of way, NYCDEP's currently preferred tie-in locations are as follows:

Alignment No. 1 (north connection): The new 12-inch water main to the Island would tie-in at an existing 20-inch water main that extends along Van Brunt Street between DeGraw Street and Hamilton Avenue. The location of the future water main extending from the Red Hook Container Terminal to Van Brunt Street has not been determined at this time; however the tie-in would occur preferably at the intersection of Van Brunt Street and Sackett, Union, or President Streets.

Alignment No. 2 (south connection): The new 12-inch water main to the Island would tie-in at an existing 20-inch water main along Conover Street. The existing 8-inch water main that runs up Sullivan Street would also be replaced with a new 12-inch water main (that would connect to the new water main to the Island). The connection down Sullivan Street would be in an existing NYCDEP right-of-way and in the existing trench that is currently home to the 8-inch water main. For this alignment, the water main would be developed entirely within the DOT right-of-way in Brooklyn.

The existing NYCDEP water lines at Sullivan Street (south connection) and the Container Port location (north connection) have on average 4 feet of cover from the top of the pipe to the existing grade. The Sullivan connection is a 12-inch pipe at the corner of Sullivan and Conover Street (total depth of excavation to bottom of pipe is 60 inches). The connection across the Container Port would be to a 20-inch line at Van Brunt and Sackett, Union, or President Streets (total depth of excavation to bottom of pipe is 68 inches). The depth of excavation could vary along the horizontal profile of the pipe in both locations, but not dramatically.

The water main(s) would be installed by horizontal directional drilling (HDD) across Buttermilk Channel. The final area of excavation at the drilling entrance and exit locations would depend on the subsurface conditions and the design of the vertical alignment of the water mains, specifically the entry/exit angles. For planning purposes, an excavated area of approximately 15 feet by 20 feet is assumed.

For the north connection, open trenching along an approximately 300-foot-long area would be required to connect the HDD excavation area to the existing water main. The open trenching would be required along the same alignment as the streets, from the connection point on Van Brunt Street (either at Sackett, Union, or President Streets).

For the south connection, open trenching would be required to connect the HDD excavation area to the end of the 8-inch water main, and to Conover Street to replace the 8-inch pipe with new 12-inch pipe. This would be approximately 150 feet in length, from the end of the existing 8-inch water main on Sullivan Street, along the same alignment as the existing street and pipe.

For any open-cut construction, the width of the trench would be no more than 6 feet. There would not be any permanent shaft structures at either connection location in Brooklyn. At this time, it is anticipated that an air/vacuum chamber would be installed at the connection point. This structure would likely be a below-grade precast concrete chamber with an interior dimension of approximately 6 feet by 10 feet. If it is located within a paved area, the top of the chamber would likely be flush with grade. If it is not located in a paved area, the top of the chamber would likely extend 6 inches above grade. In either case, a 2-foot-by-2-foot access hatch would be provided flush with the top of the chamber, along with a 6-inch diameter vent pipe that would extend approximately 2 feet above the top of the chamber.

LPC and OPRHP have determined that Alignments No. 1 and 2 would be unlikely to impact significant archaeological resources within Brooklyn or the Buttermilk Channel. LPC and/or OPRHP (as appropriate) would be consulted regarding the work to be conducted in the Alignment No. 1 area of potential effect within the Governors Island Historic District and the archaeological work plans proposed for that area.

ARCHITECTURAL RESOURCES

North Island Project Area

The design for the Phase 1 park and public space improvements within the Historic District would be reviewed and approved by LPC and/or OPRHP (as appropriate).

In general, direct historic resource impacts include demolition of a resource, and alterations to a resource that cause it to become a different visual entity. A resource also can be damaged by adjacent construction, either from vibrations (i.e., from construction blasting or pile driving) or from falling objects, subsidence, collapse, or damage from construction machinery. Adjacent construction, as defined in DOB's TPPN #10/88, is any construction activity that would occur

within 90 feet of an architectural resource. Since Phase 1 of the Proposed Project would occur on or in close proximity to contributing elements of the Governors Island Historic District, a CPP would be developed—based on the requirements stipulated in TPPN #10/88—to ensure that historic structures and landscape elements within 90 feet of construction activities would not be inadvertently affected during construction. The CPP would need to be reviewed and approved by LPC and/or OPRHP (as appropriate). Furthermore, construction of the proposed project would be conducted in accordance with the guidelines of the Design Manual. Since Phase 1 of the Proposed Project would involve no new building construction and would mainly consist of landscaping and paving improvements, no blasting, pile driving, or other vibration-intensive construction activities are assumed to be required. Therefore, it is assumed that the CPP would generally require protective fencing and netting around adjacent structures, rather than vibration monitors and pre-construction structural surveys. With the implementation of the CPP, no direct impacts on historic resources would be anticipated for Phase 1 of the Proposed Project.

Soissons Landing—Category 2/3

As described above, Phase 1 of the Proposed Project would redesign the area upland of Soissons Dock and the areas surrounding Buildings 108, 109, 110, and 140 into a public plaza with lawn, trees, and benches. No work would be required at Soissons Dock itself. Building 148 is being demolished in the future without the Proposed Project. The proposed changes in this area would be designed to be consistent with the Design Manual's guidelines for site development and landscaping, and would be reviewed by LPC and/or OPRHP (as appropriate). Therefore, the Proposed Project's work at this location would not be anticipated to adversely affect architectural resources.

Yankee Landing and Maintenance Area—No Categorization/Category 2/3

As noted above, the Yankee Landing area is not classified as a historic resource in the Design Manual. Any changes to the roadways, pedestrian walkways, and landscaping in the areas between Yankee Landing, the Parade Ground, and the South Battery would be consistent with the guidelines for site development and landscaping in the Design Manual. Therefore, the Proposed Project's work at this location would not be anticipated to adversely affect architectural resources.

South Battery and Adjacent Areas—Category 2

As described above, no changes would be made to or within the South Battery building itself, and thus no exterior or interior elements of the building that are required to be preserved would be altered. The proposed landscape design would be consistent with guidelines of the Design Manual, and any changes to the roadways and pedestrian walkways in the areas surrounding Buildings 301, 315, 324, and 330, and the area of former Building 309—would be consistent with the guidelines for site development and landscaping in the Design Manual.

The proposed changes in this area would not affect the scale of the building or its orientation between Fort Jay and the Buttermilk Channel. As described above, the Proposed Project's CPP would include stipulations to ensure that the South Battery building would not be inadvertently affected during construction.

Parade Ground—Category 2/3

While the Design Manual notes that the open lawn area of the Ft. Jay Glacis (which includes the Parade Ground) is its primary, character-defining feature, the improvements to the Parade Ground for active recreation would not significantly affect the overall appearance of this

landscape feature. The proposed active play fields would not be striped. The proposed regrading work would be a field-sized area in a section of the Glacis that is already mostly level. The regrading work would be limited to removing safety hazards and leveling out bumps and holes, some of which are a remnant of the former golf course. The overall visual appearance of the Glacis/Parade Ground as an open lawn sloping down from the fortification to the Buttermilk Channel would remain. Therefore, the Proposed Project would not adversely affect the character-defining features of the Glacis/Parade Ground. The Proposed Project's CPP would include stipulations to ensure that buildings adjacent to the Parade Ground work would not be inadvertently affected during construction activities.

Colonels Row—Category 2/3

The brick walkways and mature trees lining the Colonels Row Green's walkways are its defining features, as are its uncluttered lawn areas. The Proposed Project would maintain these features as part of the limited improvements to this area, which include tree uplighting and, potentially, irrigation and drainage improvements. Therefore, the Proposed Project would not adversely affect the character-defining features of Colonels Row Green. The Proposed Project's CPP would include stipulations to ensure that buildings adjacent to the Colonels Row Green work would not be inadvertently affected during construction activities.

Nolan Park—Category 1/2

As described above, Nolan Park's brick walkways and sidewalks and mature trees are its defining features, and the Design Manual notes that the brick and slate walkways and driveways and mature trees that surround the buildings at the edge of the Park should be preserved and maintained. It is anticipated that the landscaping work to be done in this area would be consistent with the requirements of the Design Manual, including maintaining the mature trees. The possible resetting and rerouting of existing brick walkways and sidewalks using existing or in-kind materials is not anticipated to adversely affect this character-defining feature of Nolan Park. The Proposed Project's CPP would include stipulations to ensure that buildings adjacent to the Nolan Park work would not be inadvertently affected during construction activities.

Liggett Terrace—Category 2

In Phase 1 of the Proposed Project, no changes would be made to Liggett Hall itself. Two of the previously-constructed additions within the building's west courtyard would be removed in the future without the Proposed Project. It is anticipated that the development of the Liggett Terrace public plaza would incorporate and preserve the mature London Plane trees that are currently located around the building. The Proposed Project's CPP would include stipulations to ensure that buildings adjacent to the Liggett Terrace work would not be inadvertently affected during construction activities. Therefore, the Proposed Project's work at this location would not be expected to adversely affect architectural resources.

Seawall—No Categorization

As described above, portions of the seawall enclosing the Island would be rebuilt, repointed, refaced, or replaced in Phase 1 of the Proposed Project. The seawall is not classified as a historic resource in the Design Manual, and thus the work that would be done to the seawall within the North Island would not be anticipated to adversely affect architectural resources.

Landscape

Various changes will be made to the overall landscape of the Historic District in Phase 1 of the Proposed Project, as detailed above. These changes would designed consistent with the

guidelines for site development and landscaping in the Design Manual, and would be reviewed by LPC and/or OPRHP (as appropriate). Therefore, the proposed Phase 1 landscape work would not be anticipated to adversely affect architectural resources.

South Island Project Area

Phase 1 of the Proposed Project would make park and open space improvements to the South Island. All of the buildings on the South Island—which have been determined not to be architectural resources—would be demolished in the Future Without the Proposed Project. Phase 1 work within the South Island would not involve the construction of any new buildings within the transition zone immediately south of Division Road (see discussion below). Therefore, the proposed work would not have any adverse effects on architectural resources.

On-Island Study Area

During Phase 1 of the Proposed Project, some seawall reconstruction work would occur within 90 feet of the Castle Williams structure. Therefore, the Proposed Project's CPP would include stipulations to ensure that Castle Williams would not be inadvertently affected during construction activities at the seawall. The park and open space improvements to be developed on the surrounding North Island would be anticipated to enhance the surrounding context of the National Monument's resources. Therefore, the Proposed Project would not be expected to adversely affect these architectural resources in the on-Island study area.

Off-Island Project Areas and Study Areas

As described above, there are no designated architectural resources within the off-Island project areas and study areas, and there is one potential architectural resource within the off-Island study areas. The proposed water main(s) would be developed entirely within the NYCDOT right-of-way on the Brooklyn side. There would be no above-grade permanent features (such as shaft structures) in the off-Island project areas once construction of the water main connections is completed. It is anticipated that there could be a need to install an air/vacuum valve chamber at the connection point(s). This structure would likely be a below-grade precast concrete chamber with an interior dimension of approximately 6 feet by 10 feet, but could extend up to six inches above grade. Therefore, work to be conducted in the off-Island project areas would be either not visible or minimally visible following construction and thus would not have any adverse visual or contextual effects on the potential architectural resource within the study area. The Proposed Project's CPP would include stipulations to ensure that the potential resource at 43 Ferris Street would not be inadvertently affected during construction activities for the proposed water main(s). In summary, the Proposed Project would not have an adverse effect on architectural resources within these areas or the surrounding study areas.

LATER PHASES (THROUGH 2030)

ARCHAEOLOGICAL RESOURCES

North Island Area of Potential Effect

Within the North Island, a new open canopy ferry shelter would be developed at Yankee Landing, and the Great Promenade would be widened and repaved and new lighting, way-finding elements, and guardrails would be installed. Yankee Landing also would serve as a stop on the Island's internal tram circulation program, and bicycle racks would be provided in the vicinity of Yankee Landing. No in-water work would be required for Yankee Pier itself.

Construction of the new structure at this location, utility work, planting trees, the widening and repaving of the Great Promenade, and installation of bicycle racks all would be anticipated to require subsurface disturbance. Since this area has not been identified in previous studies as having potential archaeological sensitivity, the work in these areas would not be anticipated to have any adverse impacts to archaeological resources. However, coordination with LPC and/or OPRHP (as appropriate) will be conducted to determine the need for any additional work for this area.

As described above, the archaeological protocol for excavations within the Historic District would be as follows. Plans for any excavations will be submitted to LPC and/or OPRHP, and the agency(ies) will make recommendations as to whether any archaeological work is needed. If work is required, an archaeological work plan will be submitted from an accredited archaeologist, to be reviewed and approved by LPC and/or OPRHP (as appropriate). Upon completion of the pre-approved excavation within these areas, an archaeological summary report will be sent to LPC and/or OPHRP. LPC and/or OPRHP (as appropriate) will be informed immediately if any artifacts are identified during excavations at any location within the Historic District.

Some of the buildings within the Governors Island Historic District could be utilized for the Later Phases-Island Redevelopment portion of the Proposed Project. While more information on proposed disturbance is necessary to identify potential adverse effects, it is possible that some subsurface disturbance around or below these buildings would be required for their reuse as part of the Proposed Project. If subsurface disturbance is required in or around the specific North Island buildings identified above (Area D-Quarters/Building 1, Area E-Quarters/Building 2, Area F-Building 9, and Area G-Original Shoreline), coordination with LPC and/or OPRHP (as appropriate) would be conducted to determine the need for any additional work for this area. As necessary, additional work would be conducted according to the protocol described above. Other than these areas, the buildings within the Governors Island Historic District are not identified as having potential archaeological sensitivity, and thus reuse of other buildings within the Historic District would not be anticipated to adversely affect archaeological resources.

South Island Area of Potential Effect

As described above, the South Island is not considered to be potentially archaeologically sensitive. Therefore, the activity and subsurface disturbance that would occur on this portion of the Island in the Later Phases of the Proposed Project would not affect archaeological resources.

Off-Island Area of Potential Effect

Since the work in this area would be completed in Phase I, the Later Phases of the Proposed Project would not involve any potential subsurface disturbance in the off-Island Area of Potential Effect beyond what was already disclosed above for Phase 1.

ARCHITECTURAL RESOURCES

North Island Project Area

As the Great Promenade and Yankee Landing areas are not classified as a historic resource in the Design Manual, the work that would be done for these portions of the North Island would not be anticipated to adversely affect architectural resources. The Great Promenade work also would be consistent with the Design Manual's guidelines for site development and landscaping.

The new open-air ferry shelter to be constructed at Yankee Landing—if sited within the boundaries of the Governors Island Historic District—would be required to comply with the Design Manual's "Standards for New Construction and Additions" and undergo review by LPC and/or OPRHP (as appropriate). Specifically, the perceived scale of the new construction would be similar to adjacent buildings; the new construction would preserve significant views and vistas to and from the Governors Island Historic District; and the materials used would be consistent with the new buildings' historic setting and environment. Furthermore, the new construction, including construction staging, would be undertaken in a manner that avoids damage to existing buildings, structures, landscapes, and landscape features.

As described above, more than 1.35 million square feet of potential redevelopment space is available in existing historic structures on the North Island. It is expected that some or all of this space would be retenanted in the Later Phases-Island Redevelopment of the Proposed Project, although the future uses have not yet been specifically determined or defined. The specific historic structures to be reutilized have not been identified; however, those buildings associated with any previous housing-related and office-related uses are considered most conducive for future uses such as housing for students and faculty, as well as smaller classroom and office uses. Any reuse of buildings within the Governors Island Historic District would require compliance with the guidance of the Design Manual and coordination and review by LPC and/or OPRHP (as appropriate). There are only a few structures in the Historic District that contain interior detailing which contributes to the significance of the property. As relevant, the Design Manual indicates which interior features of buildings in the Historic District should be preserved. These recommendations would be considered during the review of reutilization plans by LPC and/or OPRHP (as appropriate).

As with Phase 1 of the Proposed Project, since portions of the Later Phases of the Proposed Project would occur on or within in close proximity to contributing elements of the Governors Island Historic District, a CPP would be developed. At this time it is assumed that no blasting, pile driving, or other vibration-intensive construction activities would be required in the North Island for the Later Phases of the Proposed Project. Therefore, it is assumed that the CPP for this work would generally require protective fencing and netting around adjacent structures, rather than vibration monitors and pre-construction structural surveys. If blasting, pile driving, or other vibration-intensive activities are required, the CPP shall be amended to include vibration specifications and pre-construction surveys.

In summary, the Great Promenade and Yankee Landing work and reuse of the Governors Island Historic District buildings would not be anticipated to adversely affect architectural resources.

South Island Project Area

The parks and open space improvements to be developed on the South Island during the Later Phases of the Proposed Project are not anticipated to have a significant adverse effect on architectural resources.

The Design Manual provides the following guidance regarding new development on the South Island:

> All properties south of Division Road are outside of the Governors Island Historic District, and none are historically or architecturally significant. As such, development on this portion of the Island would not be subject to review by either LPC or OPRHP. However, the design of new construction immediately south of Division Road, directly across from the [Governors Island] Historic District, will have a relationship to and

interact with elements in the National Historic Landmark. The transition zone provides an opportunity for a clear transition from the historic buildings north of the road, to new construction and development on the south. Development in the transition zone should be sensitive to the scale and massing of the existing buildings, their siting, and their design. Development in the transition zone should be neither diminutive nor overwhelming in scale, should recognize the appropriate setbacks and pedestrian qualities of Division Road, and should maintain the character of the historic buildings to the north.

At this time, the uses associated with the Later Phases for the North Island historic buildings and the two South Island development zones are not specifically proposed, defined, or designed and their operations have not yet been planned. The Trust anticipates developing design guidelines for the South Island development zones. These guidelines will incorporate the Design Manual's recommendations regarding development in the transition zone. The South Island design guidelines would be reviewed by LPC and/or OPRHP (as appropriate).

The *CEQR Technical Manual* provides the following examples of potential visual or contextual effects to architectural resources:

- Isolation of the property from, or alteration of, its setting or visual relationships with the streetscape, including changes to the resource's visual prominence;
- Introduction of incompatible visual, audible, or atmospheric elements to a resource's setting;
- Elimination or screening of publicly-accessible views of the resource; and
- Introduction of significant new shadows, or significant lengthening of the duration of existing shadows, over an historic landscape or on an historic structure (if the features that make the resource significant depend on sunlight) to the extent that the architectural details that distinguish that resource as significant are obscured;

Given the lack of plans to review, it is not possible at this time to determine whether the full development of the Proposed Project would or would not be inconsistent with the character of the Governors Island Historic District, through altering the setting or visual prominence of the Historic District's resources, or introducing incompatible visual elements, or eliminating or screening publicly accessible views of these resources. The design guidelines for the South Island development zones would be intended to create a harmonious relationship between the new buildings, the historic buildings and landscapes, and the new landscapes. Further, when such development has been planned and designed, it is anticipated that it would require land use actions that would be subject to CEQR, and the associated future environmental review would take into account potential impacts to historic resources.

On-Island Study Area

Construction work for the Great Promenade in the Later Phases of the Proposed Project would occur within 90 feet of Castle Williams. Therefore, the Proposed Project's CPP would include stipulations to ensure that Castle Williams would not be inadvertently affected during construction activities for the Great Promenade.

The proposed usage of North Island buildings in the Later Phases of the Proposed Project is anticipated to bring additional visitation to the Island, which is consistent with NPS planning efforts to engage the public with the Monument and the wider Harbor through other new uses and programs of their own. Since coordination and review by LPC and/or OPRHP (as appropriate) would be required for the reuse of any buildings within the Governors Island Historic District, it is anticipated that this reuse would not significantly alter the exteriors of the

buildings utilized, and thus it would not be expected to have an adverse contextual effect on historic resources in the surrounding area, including adjacent portions of the Governors Island Historic District and the Governors Island National Monument.

Off-Island Project Areas and Study Areas

The Later Phases of the Proposed Project would not involve any work within the off-Island project areas, and thus there would be no potential effects to the one potential architectural resource that was identified in the off-Island study areas. Therefore, the Later Phases of the Proposed Project would not have any significant adverse effects on architectural resources within these areas. ✷